DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 232 990 SP 022 849

AUTHOR Kazi, Aftab A.
TITLE Education, Ethnici[illegible] and Political Socialization: The Case of Pakista[illegible]. Studies in Education & Politics.
PUB DATE Jul 83
NOTE 17p.; Paper presented at the World Assembly of the International Council on Education for Teaching (30th, Washington, DC, July 11-15, 1983).
PUB TYPE Viewpoints (120) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Cultural Pluralism; Educational Development; *Educational Needs; Elementary Secondary Education; *Ethnicity; Foreign Countries; Government Role; *Government School Relationship; *Nationalism; National Programs; Political Influences; *Political Power; Social Studies
IDENTIFIERS *Pakistan

ABSTRACT

This study examines the relationship between the educational system, the ethnic communities, and political instability in Pakistan. The major assumption of this study is that, with socioeconomic and political inequities aside, the educational policies alone lack the representation of indigeneous ethnic values in the national educational system, and thus, have arrested the development of Pakistani nationalism. This research addresses the issues of a socio-political and educational reordering of Pakistan, and holds that the existing stereotypical images of Pakistan are further damaging the process of national unity and cohesion. Social studies curriculum, the only uniform curriculum for Pakistani citizens, is discussed in four different political periods: (1) The Early Establishment Era (1947-1955); (2) The First Military Rule Era (1955-1968); (3) The Civilian Era (1968-1977); and (4) The Post Civilian New-Military Era (1977-present). The study concludes that only rational approaches of a participative nature, based on "indigenous ethnic arithmetic" and observation of equal socio-political justice, could strengthen the process of national integration. Only then, with a democratic infrastructure, will the educational policies be able to effect positively the process of nation and state-building. (SP)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED232990

STUDIES IN EDUCATION
& POLITICS

EDUCATION, ETHNICITY, AND POLITICAL SOCIALIZATION: THE CASE OF PAKISTAN

Aftab A. Kazi
International and Development Education Program,
University of Pittsburgh
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
Aftab A. Kazi
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
✓ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

Study to be presented at the 30th World Assembly of the International Council on Teaching for Education, Washington, D.C. July 11-15, 1983.

SP 022 849

EDUCATION, ETHNICITY, AND POLITICAL SOCIALIZATION: THE CASE OF PAKISTAN

Introduction

Conceptual Framework

Perceptions of Pakistani Society

The Curriculum and Integrative Mechanisms

Conclusion

References.

Aftab A. Kazi
University of Pittsburgh
ICET World Assembly
Washington D.C. July 11-15, 1983

EDUCATION, ETHNICITY AND POLITICAL SOCIALIZATION

The task of nation and state-building has been held by scholars to be a multi-dimensional problem involving the forging of a sense of territorial nationality, the bridging of the elite-mass gap, the establishment of a national central authority, the creation of a minimum consensus of values and devising of common integrative institutions and codes of behavior (Weiner, 1965:5254). Political socialization is the basic socio-political process through which an individual becomes integrated into a social group by learning the group's culture and his role within the group or political system. The role of education in the political socialization process is to prepare the individual to learn about his rights, obligations, expectations, and a general outlook of a socio-political role preparatory to assuming it. Thus, along with the social and economic spheres of the society, the role of education has been highly essential in the general well-being, as well as the political development of the country.

In the newly independent world, education has played a key role in the rise of nationalist movements, on the one hand, and it becomes even more important for the development process of national integrity and cohesion. The post-colonial nation-states, with enormous problems of underdevelopment at various levels, as some studies on Asian and African nationalism have noted, "are not yet nations, but nations in hope" (Emerson, 1960:94). Some of the new nation-states have ended up merely as nations in failure. As a result, political crises, such as that of national identity, penetration, participation, integration and distribution have further halted the process of political development of the new states.

Despite the fact that many of the new post-colonial states, while lacking the common attributes of nationalism, (a homogenous population, common language, historical, cultural and religious

traditions, etc.), are nonetheless attempting to achieve their goals of nation and state-building, through educational and political socialization. However, despite such attempts, in most of the developing countries, the problem of national integration continues to haunt the process of nation and state-building, the state of Pakistan is an example in this regard. The unequal political socialization process, which provides sociation for one or a few member groups of a society, while neglecting others, has been described as a major cause of failure of nation and state-building.

With its diversity of regional cultures and languages, Pakistan has had more than its share of difficulty in achieving political integration and national cohesion. In 1971, Pakistan underwent the traumatic experience of disintegration. Ethnic nationalism, (which was a product of uneven socio-economic and political policies and led to the disintegration) still continues to dominate the political scene of Pakistan. While the socio-economic and political structure has continued to develop the feelings of deprivation among Pakistani nationalities, the educational policies lack the equitable representation of the ethnic communities, which has resulted in an arrest of the growth and development of Pakistani nationalism.

Thus, the major assumption of this study is that the equal socio-economic and political opportunities for all the ethnic communities may well have strengthened the process of political socialization and national integrity of Pakistan. The study addresses the major question of whether the Pakistani educational and political system facilitates the realization of Pakistani national sentiment through socialization among various Pakistani ethnic nationalities.

While recognizing the importance of socio-economic equality, emphasis is given to the national Social Studies curriculum as an instrument of value education, and its contribution to the development of Pakistani nationalism. For methodological purposes, instead of relying on education enrollment data to describe educational policies, this study focuses upon the correlation between the policies and the conditions under which they were formed, as

an indicator for the success or failure of these policies.

Theoretical Framework

While nationalism is an aspect of the ideology of a nation, national integration is the process of achieving nation-hood. It is through the political socialization process that both goals of nation and state-building are achieved. Nationalism has been defined as a "belief on the part of a large group of people that they comprise a political community, a nation, that is entitled to independent state-hood and a willingness of the group to grant their community a primary and terminal loyalty (Cottam, 1947:4). National integration, according to Deutch, is a process by which "within a given territory, people will have attained a sense of community, institutions, and practice strong enough and wide spread enough to assure for a long time, dependable expectations of peaceful change among its population (Deutch, 1970:72).

Under the scope of these definitions, in culturally pluralistic societies, the socialization process requires certain strategies that reflect the perceptions of the society and integrative tendencies of the ruling elite. The two most common public policy strategies involved in this process are (1) the assimilation process, which eliminates the distinctive cultural traits of the different groups into some type of national culture, usually that of the dominant group, and (2) the "unity in diversity" process, which attempts to establish national loyalities, without eliminating various ethnic cultures, politically characterized as "ethnic arithmetic". Schermerhorn refers to those strategies as centripetal and centrifugal tendencies. According to him, "a centripetal tendency refers to a group's cultural and structural trends towards common society-wide life styles and institutional participation, while a centrifugal tendency would manifest itself in a group by retaining and preserving the unique cultural attributes, as well as to seek greater autonomy politically and economically (Schermerhorn, 1970:14). Thus, in the context of this study, a successful political socialization would take place, if the ruling and the ruled groups share a tendency, whether centripetal or centri-

fugal, thus, an agreed upon form of integration is likely to result. If one group seeks closer ties or hegemony, and the other seeks greater autonomy, the total socialization process would be full of conflict. In educational analysis, a centrifugal tendency may encourage each ethnic group's language to be used as a medium of instruction, at least at the lower level, and represent ethnic groups values in the national curriculum. The centripetal tendencies may reflect the values of the dominant group in the formation of national culture and character, and may cause political unrest among the dominated ethnic groups. The centrifugal tendencies may require a recognition of the principle of cultural pluralism, in the educational policies, while the centripetal tendencies may ignore it, and in that case, the educational and political socialization process may not achieve the desired results.

Another important aspect of the socialization process are the integrative mechanisms employed. LaBelle and White have described these mechanisms as coercion, consensus, and interdependence (1980:156). More than one of these mechanisms may be applied in a single group relationship, one for the structural or political relationship, another for cultural relations. Coercion, in this study, refers to the use of force or non-consensual socio-economic and political pressures. In educational analysis, such pressures manifest themselves in the centripetal structural or cultural tendencies, lack of academic freedom, uneven allocation of resources, nonrepresentative curriculum, which creates feelings of deprivation and affects the achievement level of students. Consensus, is seen as a neutral outcome of a set of values and is maintained by compromising the integrative tendencies of all the ethnic groups, and recognizes and respects the principle of cultural pluralism. Interdependence is basically a structural relationship, most common in the confederation form of political systems, in which, according to Paulston, various groups or segments of these groups, function within a common network of economic and social order, without necessarily sharing the cultural or political values, or without agreeing upon the fairness of the network itself (1978:14).

The application of these mechanisms depends upon the perceptions of the ruling elite concerning society. However, the use of coercion alone, may not keep a society together indefinitely, and may cause feelings of deprivation, thus, widening the conflict in integrative perceptions of the ethnic groups, which may cause further political instability.

Relative deprivation in this study, is defined as the disadvantage of ethnic groups in comparison with the relatively advantaged dominant groups. The feeling is caused by unequal distribution of resources. In educational analysis, it reflects the pressure of other social, political and economic inequalities. According to Foster, it expresses "the differences in perceptions, conception, and strategy of the various socio-political groups regarding the goal of desirable results" (1980:9). In other words, if the previous expectations of the diverse ethnic groups do not match with their present achievements in the system, the dominated groups tend to develop feelings of deprivation, which it turn, may dictate their behavior and thus result in changing perceptions.

Perception, in this regard, has been defined as a tendency of individuals to perceive those elements of a situation which determines the differences in previous expectations and present achievements (Theoderson, 1979:295). Those who perceive themselves at a loss manifest their frustration, and in most cases, recourse to violence to demand what they perceive are their basic rights. The frustration-aggression hypothesis was developed to explain this phenomena. It declares that "frustration always generates an instigation to aggression" (Dollard, 1939). Dollard's theory is basically a psychological one based on the realization that " ... past expectations or desires will not be achieved in the present". James Davies supported this theory in his sociological analysis, and wrote that " ... group frustration indicated by the gap between expected need satisfaction and actual need satisfaction, produces revolution" (Davies, 1962:5-19). Ted Gurr connected the frustration-aggression theory directly with relative deprivation. He pursuasively argued that the necessary condition/ pre-condition for violence is relative deprivation, defined as a

a given entity's perception of the discrepancy between its value expectations and value capabilities are the conditions that determine people's perceived chances of getting or keeping the values they legitimately expect to obtain. In Dr. Gurr's opinion, the potential for collective violence is greater when the gap between value expectation and value capabilities increases over time. The relative deprivation theory assists in analyzing the socio-political situations in a conflict perspective. In education analysis, it assists in exploring the effects of deprivation on the national educational policies, which reflect the existence of other socio-economic inequalities, hence, their impact over the political socialization process and national integrity. It also helps in preparation for making rational choices toward conflict resolution which can enhance national confidence and morale towards a better nation-hood.

This review of literature enables us to construct the analytical model for the Pakistani society, which is as follows:

(1) Rational understanding of the strategies of political socialization, the assimilationist and ethnic arithmetic paradigms, is required to understand the goals of national integrity.

(2) The imbalances in expectations and achievement widen the gap between a given entity/entities past images and present circumstances.

(3) Dissatisfaction may cause the entities to re-interpret and re-evaluate their situations for society, that conform their past images and policies.

(4) Perceived frustration and deprivation and a lack of understanding by the ruling elite, may confuse the reality, and engage both in distorted perceptions and stereo-type images leading towards societal disunity.

(5) Educational policies must recognize the principle of cultural pluralism in order to satisfy the perceptions of the dominated, in terms of allocation of resources, access to education, and cultural views of the community in the curriculum.

This framework can be applied in the political socialization process of many culturally pluralistic post-colonial societies.

Perceptions and Pakistani Society

As a socio-psychological phenomena, perceptions have been used as an analytical tool to describe inter-group behavior and national character in culturally pluralistic societies. In this analysis, they are used as an instrument to determine the tendencies of Pakistani ethnic nationalities (the Baluchi, Pathans, Punjubi, and Sindhi) towards political socialization and national integration by the dominant groups of the society. Perceptions are always subject to change in accordance with the balances in value expectations and value achievements. The changing nature of perceptions, over time, may dictate the change of integrative tendencies among the whole integrative network. However, this greatly depends upon the integrative mechanisms employed in society - coercion, consensus, and interdependence. The application of coercion alone has widened the gap in integrative tendencies as is reflected by the case of the Bengalis in Pakistan, inter-ethnic relations in African countries, and the experiences of colonial empires in the past, as well.

In educational analysis, the positive educational contribution toward political socialization and national integrity, depend upon the perceptions of the dominant group and the nature of its integrative mechanisms. While full recognition of the principle of cultural plurality in the educational policy issue areas, may positively affect the process of political socialization, denial of them, may produce a conflict in expectations and achievements. In the latter case, the students of diverse ethnic backgrounds, may feel themselves alienated from the overall societal structure, if their own ethnic background is not represented in the national curriculum as an objective part of the society. A curriculum which represents the values of only the dominant group may also effect the rate of achievement among the students of the dominated groups of the society, thus, may effect the total political development of the society.

While the scope of this study does not permit the analysis of historical circumstances that have formulated the perceptions of Pakistani society, however, as with most other nation-states,

the educational policy issue areas in the national curriculum, the ideological aspects of which, have been important in describing the perceived integrative tendencies of the ruling elite. These tendencies also may serve as an indicator to analyze other policy issue areas related to political socialization and national integrity.

The ideological aspects of the Pakistani society stem from the very basic realities of the Pakistani movement as is suggested from the debate on Pakistan as an Islamic state or a Muslim state. While under the notion of an Islamic state, the assimilationist paradigm of integration and political socialization, with the elimination of all the ethnic values, has been implemented, the notion of a Muslim state, encourages the "unity in diversity" perspective, along with its greater political autonomy and the teaching of ethnic studies in the national curriculum. Briefly speaking, while the ruling elite maintains that Pakistan should be an Islamic state and perceives integration in assimilationist terms, with the elimination of indigenous ethnic nationalities into a homogeneous Pakistani culture; the ethnic nationalities perceive Pakistan as a multi-ethnic Muslim state, based on a national integration process that insures "unity in diversity" with ethnic arithmetic.

The Curriculum and Integrative Mechanisms

Most of the newly independent states which lack the traditional attributes required for nationalism, have often used value education as an instrument of political socialization for the growth of national sentiment, character and national integrity. While equal socio-economic and political opportunities for all national groups assists in maintaining a peaceful status quo, it is through the "pre-planned" natioanl curriculum that the young people of the society are taught to adopt themselves to the society, according to the defined integrative attitudes of society and/or that of the ruling elite.

The "pre-planned" nature of the national curriculum, thus is reflective of the integrative mechanisms employed to achieve this goal.

In Pakistani society, the Social Studies curriculum is the only uniform curriculum for all Pakistani citizens, hence is reflective of the integrative tendencies of the ruling elite. This section of the study, briefly describes the correlation between the national curriculum and the integrative perceptions of the Pakistani society from the perspective of four different Pakistani governments, and its impact on the process of political socialization in the country. The four different eras are:

1. The Early Establishment Era 1947-1955
2. The First Military Rule Era 1955-1968
3. The Civilian Era 1968-1977
4. The Post Civilian New-Military Era 1977-Present

1. The Early Establishment era includes the period between 1947 to 1955. During this early era, while the spirit of the Pakistan movement was strong, the curriculum reflects the integrative tendencies of Paksitan as a Muslim state and seems to have treated the ethnic nationalities with a "unity in diversity" approach. The integrative mechanism seems to be that of the consensus approach, rather than of the coercive or interdependent approaches. The history book describes all five of the Pakistani nationalities as "five different flowers of a garden", which is reflective of the centrifugal tendencies of cultural pluralism. During this era, the languages of ethnic nationalities were respectively used as the medium of instruction up to the high school level, and Urdu, as the national language, was taught as a compulsory subject from the fifth grade onwards. Emphasis on the indigenous history and culture in terms of its representation in the texts, has been found proportionately. Contributions of ethnic nationalities in the independence struggle have been portrayed equally. Not only have the Muslim leaders of indigenous nationalities been mentioned, but the Hindu leaders and their contributions have also been referred to in the curriculum.

Briefly, the curriculum of the early era reflects centrifugal tendencies and the consensus mechanism as inherent in the notion of Pakistan as an ideological state.

2. The Military Era. Among many reasons, the change from a civilian to a military government was partly a result of the

of the power struggle among the various Pakistani groups, which began with the death of the main leader, M.A. Jinah. The immediate successors of Jinah, who belonged to a minority, established a close alliance with the Army in order to preserve their own rule. In 1955, a major change is reflected in Pakistan history, which re-interprets the concept of Pakistan, from a Muslim state to an Islamic state. Under the new concept, all the West Pakistani nationalities were forcibly united into one single province. Since that time, merely speaking of ethnicity was considered as anti-Pakistani or regionalistic. The centrifugal tendencies of the previous era were replaced with the centripetal policies. To be a Sindhi, a Bengali or a Baluch was considered a crime.

The curriculum of this era has described Pakistan purely in physical geographical terms. The ethnic studies were not at all permitted. Urdu, the national language, which has no roots in Pakistani soil and is spoken by less than three percent of the total population, was imposed as compulsory, while all the children of indigenous ethnic communities were supposed to forget their own mother tongues. The texts seem to have de-emphasized the accounts of indigenous history and culture, as well as the accounts of ethnic contributions to the national struggle. Instead, the history and culture of central India seems to be treated as the historical and cultural heritage of Pakistan.

During this era, the elimination of the ethnic identities from the political scene suggests an assimilationist perception of Pakistani society by the new military elite. The de-emphasis of ethnic studies suggests the replacement of the censensus integrative mechanism with that of the coercive mechanism during this era.

3. The Civilian Era. The use of coercive mechanisms led to a political crisis that resulted with the Bangla Desh civil war and the dismemberment of Pakistan. In the face of this political crisis, the military rulers of Pakistan, for the first time in seventeen years, transferred power to the civilian leadership under Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The ethnic identites and

their provincial autonomy was re-established during this era. However, during the past seventeen years, certain new classes in Pakistani society were created by the military government to support its rule, it was not easy for the post-military civilian government to establish its stronghold over the political power immediately. Differences over the implementation of provincial autonomy led to a military operation in Baluchi ethnic areas. Despite the fact that ethnic identities were re-established, the civilian government, for their own reasons, could not avoid the use of coercive force to deal with the ethnic dissent.

The curriculum of the civilian era, then though describes the importance of the ethnic nationalities, also emphasizes the notions of Pakistan as an Islamic state. However, now, in terms of "Islamic social justice", thus, on purely fundamental grounds. Urdu remained as the national language, while all the ethnic provinces were encouraged to adopt their own languages as the official languages of the province. Thus, the social studies textbooks of the civilian era, while recognizing the principle of cultural pluralism and ethnic arithmetic, show a multiple use of both the coercive and the consensus mechanisms toward national integration.

4. The Post-Civilian New Military Era. The re-establishment of ethnic identities was not well taken by the new classes that were created to support the military rule of the pre-civilian era. The conflict of interests between these new classes, and the ethnic communities, resulted in a military coup d' etat in July of 1977, the overthrow of the civilian government. The new military government recoursed to the notion of an Islamic state, however, this time of a fundamentalist nature, and a campaign of forced Islamization has been carried out since 1977. The curriculum of this era has overemphasized the Islamic interpretation of every socio-political and economic event. Although the curriculum describes residuary Pakistan as being composed of four ethnic groups, the description is made purely in administrative terms, rather than in ethnic terms. The removal of ethnic studies from the national curriculum and the restrictions on the indigenous languages suggest the use of

merely the coercive mechanism, and once again assimilationist tendencies of the ruling elite.

Conclusion

In the final analysis, during each of the four eras, the Social Studies curriculum has reflected different perceptions of the ruling elite in Pakistan. While each ruling elite has attempted to act upon its own perceptions, each new generation of young people has expereinced further confusion with the inconsistency of information and concepts in the textbooks.

Violation of the principle of cultural pluralism, which has favored one group, while neglecting others, has led to the feelings of relative deprivation and caused frustration among the ethnic nationalities.

The expectations and achievements conflict has further widened the gap in the perception of Pakistani society. Educational inequalities suggest the presence of many other socio-economic inequalities, and thus limit the chances of political socialization among all the ethnic nationalities.

The conflict of perceptions concerning Pakistan as a Muslim or an Islamic state does not seem to be derived from the original concept of Pakistan, but from the post-Jinah power struggle.

This analysis suggests that the curriculum alone may not be an effective factor in the process of nation and state-building, until and unless it is in pace with the socio-political and economic realities of the society. Moreover, the changing nature of the curriculum, with each major political change in the government, as reflected in this study of Pakistan, supports the thesis that education is the result of the manipulation of the government and its power elite.

While in Pakistan, the nature of the ethnic conflict centers upon the ideological and socio-economic spheres, in most newly independent states of the Third World, such conflict centers along socio-economic and racial lines. The process and the levels of conflict in the developing world can be analyzed within this model of relative deprivation and perception.

In the process of nation and state-building, along with the socio-economic spheres, without the recognition and implementation of cultural pluralism in the educational policy issue areas, a positive sociation of citizens may not be possible. The use of force and an imposed political socialization, though may keep the country together, however, not for any length of time.

BOOKS FOR REFERENCE

Cottam, Richard W. Nationalism in Iran. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1978.

Davies James, "Towards A Theory of Revolution," American Sociological Review, Volume 24,(February 1962).

Dollard John. Frustration and Aggression. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1939.

Emerson Rupert. From Empire to Nation. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1960.

LaBelle White, and Thomas Peter, "Educationa and Multi-Ethnic Integration," Comparative Education Review, (June 1980).

LaPorte, Robert Jr. Power and Privilege: Influence and Decision-Making in Pakistan, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975.

Kazi Aftab A. The Problem of Military Intervention in Pakistani Politics. Thesis at the Center for International Security Studies, University of Pittsburgh, 1981.

Monchar P.H. "Regional Educational Inequality and Political Instability," Comparative Education Review, (February 1981).

Paulston Rolland. Theories of Social and Educational Change. Pittsburgh, International and Development Education Program, University of Pittsburgh, 1976.

Sherherhorn R.A. Comparative Ethnic Relations. New York: Random House, 1970.

Weiner Myron, "Political Integration and Political Development" in Frank Tacho, The Developing Nations: What Path to Modernization ? New York: Dodd Mead and Co. 1972.

Weiner Myron."The Politics of South Asia" in Almond and Coleman (ed.) The Politics of the Developing Areas. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1960.

And 12 Social Studies Textbooks, in order with the four major educational and political changes in Pakistan.